# Case 3:16-cv-02276-JST Document 201 Filed 12/21/17 Page 1 of 5

| 1 2 | Jahan C. Sagafi (Cal. Bar No. 224887)<br>Cristina Schrum-Herrera (Cal. Bar No. 3153<br>Laura I. Mattes (Cal. Bar No. 310594)<br>OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP | Adam T. Klein (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )  19) Melissa L. Stewart (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )  Daniel Stromberg (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )  OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP |
|-----|---|--|
| 3   | One Embarcadero Center, 38th Floor  | 685 Third Avenue, 25th Floor   |
| 4   | San Francisco, CA 94111   | New York, NY 10017   |
| 5   | Telephone: (415) 638-8800<br>Facsimile: (415) 638-8810  | Telephone: (212) 245-1000<br>Facsimile: (646) 509-2060   |
| 6   | E-mail: jsagafi@outtengolden.com  | E-mail: atk@outtengolden.com   |
| 7   | E-mail: cschrumherrera@outtengolden.com<br>E-mail: imattes@outtengolden.com   | E-mail: mstewart@outtengolden.com E-mail: dstromberg@outtengolden.com  |
| 8   | Daniel Kohrman (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) Laurie McCann (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )  | Lucy B. Bansal (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP   |
| 9   | Dara Smith (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )  | 601 Massachusetts Avenue NW,   |
| 10  | AARP FOUNDATION LITIGATION  | Second Floor West  |
| 11  | 601 E. Street, N.W.<br>Washington, D.C. 20049   | Washington, D.C. 20001<br>Telephone: (202) 847-4400  |
| 12  | Telephone: (202) 434-2060   | Facsimile: (202) 847-4410  |
|     | Facsimile: (202) 434-2082<br>E-mail: dkohrman@aarp.org  | E-mail: lbansal@outtengolden.com   |
| 13  | E-mail: lmccann@aarp.org  |  |
| 14  | E-mail: dsmith@aarp.org   |  |
| 15  | Additional counsel on next page.  |  |
| 16  | Attorneys for Plaintiffs and Proposed Class   |  |
| 17  | and Collective Members  |  |
| 18  |   |  |
|     |   | ES DISTRICT COURT  |
| 19  |   | CRICT OF CALIFORNIA CISCO DIVISION   |
| 20  | STEVE RABIN and JOHN CHAPMAN,   | Case No. 16-cy-02276-JST   |
| 21  | on behalf of themselves, and all others   | DI AINTHEES! ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION   |
| 22  | similarly situated,   | PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION<br>FOR LEAVE TO FILE UNDER SEAL  |
| 23  | Plaintiffs,   | CERTAIN MATERIALS RELATED TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR CONDITIONAL  |
| 24  | v.  | COLLECTIVE CERTIFICATION AND   |
| 25  | PRICEWATERHOUSECOOPERS LLP,   | ISSUANCE OF COURT-AUTHORIZED<br>NOTICE PURSUANT TO 29 U.S.C. § 216(b)  |
| 26  | Defendant.  | Date: March 1, 2018  |
| 27  |   | Time: 2:00 p.m. Courtroom: 9, 19 <sup>th</sup> Floor   |
| 28  |   | Judge: The Honorable Jon S. Tigar  |
| 20  |   |  |

PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO SEAL CASE NO. 16-CV-02276-JST

## Case 3:16-cv-02276-JST Document 201 Filed 12/21/17 Page 2 of 5

Jennifer L. Liu (Cal. Bar No. 279370) THE LIU LAW FIRM, P.C. 1170 Market Street, Suite 700 San Francisco, CA 94102 Telephone: (415) 896-4260 Facsimile: (415) 231-0011 E-mail: jliu@liulawpc.com 

### NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION

Pursuant to the Northern District of California Civil Local Rules 79-5(d) and 7-11, Plaintiffs respectfully submit this Administrative Motion for Leave to File Under Seal Certain Materials Related to Plaintiffs' Motion for Conditional Collective Action Certification and Issuance of Court-Authorized Notice Pursuant to 29 U.S.C §216(b) ("Sealing Motion"). This Sealing Motion is supported by the authorities cited herein and the Declaration of Melissa L. Stewart in Support of Plaintiffs' Administrative Motion for Leave to File Under Seal Materials Related to Plaintiffs' Motion for Conditional Collective Certification and Issuance of Court-Authorized Notice Pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 216(b) ("Stewart Decl.").

The Ninth Circuit recognizes "the general history of access and the public policies favoring disclosure, such as the public interest in understanding the judicial process." *Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1178-79 (9th Cir. 2006) (internal quotations and citations omitted). "'It is clear that the courts of this country recognize general right to inspect and copy public records and documents, including judicial records and documents." *Ctr. for Auto Safety v. Chrysler Grp., LLC*, 809 F.3d 1092, 1096 (9th Cir. 2016) (quoting *Nixon v. Warner Communs., Inc.*, 435 U.S. 589, 597(1978)). "[A] strong presumption in favor of access" is the starting point. *Id.* (internal quotations omitted). Accordingly, "a court may seal records only when it finds a compelling reason" that is supported by specific facts. *Id.* at 1096-97 (internal modifications and quotations omitted).¹ In deciding whether to seal, a court must "conscientiously balance[] the competing interests" of the public and the [moving] party." *Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1179. If the court finds that sealing of certain judicial records is appropriate, it must "base its decision on a compelling reason and articulate the factual basis for its ruling, without relying on hypothesis or conjecture." *Id.* (internal quotations and citations omitted).

Here, Plaintiffs seek to redact two limited categories of information. First, Plaintiffs seek to protect contact information for collective and potential collective member, including email

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For sealed materials attached to a discovery motion unrelated to the merits of the case, a party need only to meet the "good cause" standard. *Ctr. for Auto Safety*, 809 F.3d at 1097.

## Case 3:16-cv-02276-JST Document 201 Filed 12/21/17 Page 4 of 5

| 1  | addresses, phone numbers, and mailing addresses, contained in the resume attachments to the   |  |  |
|----|---|--|--|
| 2  | declarations they submitted in support of Plaintiffs' Plaintiffs' Motion for Conditional Collective   |  |  |
| 3  | Certification and Issuance of Court-Authorized Notice Pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 216(b)  |  |  |
| 4  | ("Conditional Certification Motion"). See Conditional Certification Motion, Exhibits 121-123,   |  |  |
| 5  | 125-127, 129-135, 137, 139-142, 144-149; <sup>2</sup> Stewart Decl. ¶¶ 5-28.  |  |  |
| 6  | Second, Plaintiffs seek to redact contact information for the Named Plaintiffs contained  |  |  |
| 7  | in email correspondence with PwC employees. <sup>3</sup> See Conditional Certification Motion, Exhibits   |  |  |
| 8  | 66, 67, 78; Stewart Decl. ¶¶ 2-4.   |  |  |
| 9  | Plaintiffs respectfully submit that public disclosure of this personal contact information  |  |  |
| 10 | would compromise the privacy of the individuals and there is no countervailing public interest in   |  |  |
| 11 | the information. Stewart Decl. ¶¶ 2-28. PwC does not oppose Plaintiffs' sealing requests. <i>Id</i> .   |  |  |
| 12 | Per Civil Local Rule 79-5(d)(1)(C), Plaintiffs have attached redacted and unredacted  |  |  |
| 13 | copies of these exhibits to the Stewart Declaration, as Exhibits A1-AA2.  |  |  |
| 14 | Dated: December 21, 2017 Respectfully submitted,  |  |  |
| 15 |   |  |  |
| 16 | By: <u>/s/ Melissa L. Stewart</u><br>Melissa L. Stewart   |  |  |
| 17 | Jahan C. Sagafi (Cal. Bar No. 224887)   |  |  |
| 18 | Cristina Schrum-Herrera (Cal. Bar No. 315319)<br>Laura I. Mattes (Cal. Bar No. 310594)  |  |  |
| 19 | OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP   |  |  |
| 20 | One Embarcadero Center, 38th Floor<br>San Francisco, CA 94111   |  |  |
|    | Telephone: (415) 638-8800   |  |  |
| 21 | Facsimile: (415) 638-8810   |  |  |
| 22 | E-mail: jsagafi@outtengolden.com  |  |  |
| 23 | E-mail: cschrumherrera@outtengolden.com   |  |  |
| 24 | <sup>2</sup> After Plaintiffs submitted the Conditional Certification Motion to the Court via email and hand delivery (pursuant to the procedure set forth in ECF No. 185), Plaintiffs realized that they had |  |  |
| 25 | inadvertently included documents containing communications protected by the Attorney Client privilege (in addition to collective member contact information) on the final pages of Exhibit                    |  |  |
| 26 | 121, Exhibit 139, and Exhibit 144. This information should not have been filed at all. The  |  |  |
| 27 | Court has already granted Plaintiffs' motion to remove similar pages from the docket in another instance. See ECF No. 195 (Order dated Dec. 18, 2017). To avoid burdening the Court with                      |  |  |
|    | additional motion practice to correct this error, Plaintiffs have excluded those pages from today's electronic filing. Defendant consents to this change.   |  |  |
| 28 | <sup>3</sup> Pursuant to Defendant's request, Plaintiffs have also redacted PwC employee contact information contained in these exhibits. Plaintiffs do not oppose these redactions.                          |  |  |
|    | PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE  |  |  |

PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO SEAL CASE NO. 16-CV-02276-JST

# Case 3:16-cv-02276-JST Document 201 Filed 12/21/17 Page 5 of 5

| 1  | E-mail: imattes@outtengolden.com  |
|----|---|
| 2  | Adam T. Klein (admitted pro hac vice)   |
| 3  | Melissa L. Stewart (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) Daniel Stromberg (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) |
| 4  | OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP   |
| 5  | 685 Third Avenue, 25th Floor<br>New York, NY 10017  |
| 6  | Telephone: (212) 245-1000   |
| 7  | Facsimile: (646) 509-2060<br>E-mail: atk@outtengolden.com   |
|    | E-mail: mstewart@outtengolden.com   |
| 8  | E-mail: dstromberg@outtengolden.com   |
| 9  | Lucy B. Bansal (admitted pro hac vice)  |
| 10 | OUTTEN & GOLDEN LLP 601 Massachusetts Avenue NW, 2d Floor West                                      |
| 11 | Washington, D.C. 20001  |
|    | Telephone: (202) 847-4400   |
| 12 | Facsimile: (202) 847-4410   |
| 13 | E-mail: lbansal@outtengolden.com  |
| 14 | Daniel Kohrman (admitted pro hac vice)  |
|    | Laurie McCann (admitted pro hac vice)   |
| 15 | Dara Smith (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) AARP FOUNDATION LITIGATION                               |
| 16 | 601 E. Street, N.W.   |
|    | Washington, D.C. 20049  |
| 17 | Telephone: (202) 434-2060   |
| 18 | Facsimile: (202) 434-2082   |
|    | E-mail: dkohrman@aarp.org   |
| 19 | E-mail: lmccann@aarp.org<br>E-mail: dsmith@aarp.org   |
| 20 | E-man. dsimul@aarp.org  |
| 21 | Jennifer L. Liu (Cal. Bar No. 279370)<br>THE LIU LAW FIRM, P.C.                                     |
| 22 | 1170 Market Street, Suite 700   |
| 22 | San Francisco, CA 94102   |
| 23 | Telephone: (415) 896-4260   |
| 24 | Facsimile: (415) 231-0011   |
|    | E-mail: jliu@liulawpc.com   |
| 25 | Counsel for Plaintiffs and Proposed Class and   |
| 26 | Collective Members  |
| 27 |   |
| 28 |   |
|    |   |

PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO SEAL CASE NO. 16-CV-02276-JST